

---

# Fake views & alternative stats: Recent conflicting economic assessments of trophy hunting

---



Wildlife Economy Workshop

15-17 March 2017 - Pretoria, South Africa

Earthmind.org

@Earthmind

# Hunting & sustainable development in Africa

---

**Southwick. 2015. The Economic Contributions of Hunting-Related Tourism in Eastern and Southern Africa. Southwick Associates. For Safari Club International Foundation. November, 2015**

versus

**Murray, C. K. 2017. The lion's share? On the economic benefits of trophy hunting. A report for the Humane Society International, prepared by Economists at Large, Melbourne, Australia**

**or The 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development**

# 'Alternative stats' - Southwick's bottom line

Annual Spending and Economic Impacts within the Eight Nation Study Area; 2012-2014 Average

Country	Spending In-Country Per Hunter <sup>2</sup>	Spending In-Country, All Hunters	Contribution to GDP (Value Added)	Full- and Part-time Jobs
Botswana <sup>1</sup>	\$20,602	\$7,210,737	\$8,076,025	316
Ethiopia	\$20,602	\$432,644	\$644,640	503
Mozambique	\$20,602	\$8,817,701	\$12,080,250	10,690
Namibia	\$14,840	\$105,007,764	\$115,508,540	8,367
South Africa	\$16,835	\$141,197,113	\$206,147,785	12,742
Tanzania	\$20,602	\$16,358,071	\$28,790,206	14,161
Zambia	\$20,602	\$8,199,638	\$10,413,540	782
Zimbabwe	\$28,859	\$39,276,470	\$44,775,176	5,861
<b>Total</b>	<b>\$20,602</b>	<b>\$326,500,138</b>	<b>\$426,436,162</b>	<b>53,423</b>

<sup>1</sup> Botswana effectively eliminated hunting beginning in 2014.

If hunters did not visit Africa, annual GDP in the study area's economy would shrink by **\$426.4 million.**

The rounds of spending initiated by visiting hunters annually support **over 53,400 jobs...**

# 'Alternative stats' - Murray's bottom line

TABLE 1: ADJUSTMENTS FOR METHODOLOGICAL PROBLEMS IN SOUTHWICK (2015).

		BOTSWANA	ETHIOPIA	MOZAMBIQUE	NAMIBIA	SOUTH AFRICA	TANZANIA	ZAMBIA	ZIMBABWE	TOTAL
HUNTER RECEIPTS	(\$USDm)	7.2	0.4	8.8	105.0	141.2	16.4	8.2	39.4	326
NON-HUNTING VISITS	(x0.89)	6.4	0.4	7.8	93.5	125.7	14.6	7.3	35.1	291
NON-HUNTING SPEND	(x0.65)	4.2	0.2	5.1	60.7	81.7	9.5	4.7	22.8	189
ECONOMIC BENEFIT OF ALTERNATIVE USE	30%	2.9	0.2	3.6	43	57	6.6	3.3	16.0	132
	50%	2.1	0.1	2.5	30	41	4.7	2.4	11.4	95
	70%	1.2	0.1	1.5	18	25	2.8	1.4	6.8	57
	100%	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
TOTAL EMPLOYMENT	No.	316	503	10,690	8,367	12,742	14,161	783	5,861	53,423
ADJUSTED NET EMPLOYMENT	(x0.14)	44.2	70.4	1,496	1,171	1,783	1,982	109	820	7,479
	(x0.29)	91.6	145.9	3,100	2,426	3,695	4,106	227	1,699	15,492

All values in \$USD million.

... a value between zero and \$USD 132 million.

The number of jobs supported by trophy hunting is likely to be between 7,500 and 15,500.

# Southwick's approach

---

- 1) determining the number of hunters... based on license and visitor data provided by each country
- 2) measuring the amounts spent by hunters per trip within and outside of their destination country,
- 3) estimating the economic impacts... using generally accepted economic multipliers, and
- 4) comparing the results to previous similar research to ground truth the results

# Murray's approach

---

## 3 methodological problems in Southwick

- 1) ignoring the opportunity cost of land and wildlife resources by assuming no ability to substitute land and wildlife resources towards other uses (such as non-consumptive tourism),
- 2) attributing all non-trophy hunting tourism expenditure by trophy hunters to hunting, and
- 3) using economic multipliers to determine total economic contribution.

## *'Fake views'* - Southwick's observations

---

- Over eighty percent of hunters say they would not have gone if the opportunity to hunt was not available... The spending by most hunters would then be forgone revenue...
- Providing income for areas otherwise limited in economic opportunities. ...[areas] not physically attractive enough... for photo safari operations. Neither does agriculture offer reasonable economic opportunities.
- Eliminating hunting would likely significantly reduce efforts to conserve and protect African wildlife, and result in many species being regarded as economic negatives in many places.

## *'Fake views'* - Murray's observations

---

- Trophy hunting may actually deter growth in other forms of tourism, and these costs may overwhelm any economic benefits (already recognized to be minor) of the trophy hunting industry.
- Given past experiences of unsustainable trophy hunting leading to serious population declines and ultimately bans on trophy hunting, one cannot automatically conclude that simply because there are economic activities associated with trophy hunting, that this is inherently benefiting conservation.

# More methodological issues in these studies

---

**Appropriate metrics** - economic value or contribution to sustainable development?

**Appropriate scales** - contribution at the national level and/or at local levels?

**Distributional issues** - e.g., contributions to rural communities

**Dynamic effects** - hunting, tourism and other land uses over time

**Synergistic effects** - multiple land uses including hunting

# How do we assess the value of hunting in Africa?

---

- Are both of these studies missing the bigger picture?
- Should we be focusing on economic benefits or on the broader contribution to sustainable development?
- Does the internationally-agreed 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development offer a framework for assessment?



# The 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development

---

This Agenda is a plan of action for people, planet and prosperity.

**Planet** - We are determined to protect the planet from degradation, including through sustainable consumption and production, sustainably managing its natural resources and taking urgent action on climate change, so that it can support the needs of the present and future generations.

**Vision** - We envisage a world in which... consumption and production patterns and use of all natural resources - from air to land, from rivers, lakes and aquifers to oceans and seas - are sustainable.

# Key Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs)

---

**Goal 8** - Promote sustained, inclusive and sustainable economic growth...

**Goal 12** - Ensure sustainable consumption and production patterns

**Goal 14** - Conserve and sustainably use the oceans, seas and marine resources for sustainable development

**Goal 15** - Protect, restore and promote sustainable use of terrestrial ecosystems, sustainably manage forests, combat desertification, and halt and reverse land degradation and halt biodiversity loss

**Goal 17** - Strengthen the means of implementation...

# Relevant SDG 8 Targets - inclusive growth

---

**Target 8.2** - Achieve higher levels of economic productivity through diversification, technological upgrading and innovation, including through a focus on high-value added and labour-intensive sectors

**Target 8.3** - Promote development-oriented policies that support productive activities, decent job creation, entrepreneurship, creativity and innovation, and encourage the formalization and growth of micro-, small- and medium-sized enterprises, including through access to financial services

# Relevant SDG 12 Targets - sustainable production

---

**Target 12.2** - By 2030, achieve the sustainable management and efficient use of natural resources

**Target 12.8** - By 2030, ensure that people everywhere have the relevant information and awareness for sustainable development and lifestyles in harmony with nature

# Relevant SDG 14 Targets - marine sustainable use

---

**Target 14.4** - By 2020, ... implement science-based management plans, in order to restore fish stocks in the shortest time feasible, at least to levels that can produce maximum sustainable yield as determined by their biological characteristics

**Target 14.7** - By 2030, increase the economic benefits to Small Island developing States and least developed countries from the sustainable use of marine resources, including through sustainable management of fisheries, aquaculture and tourism

# Relevant SDG 15 Targets - terrestrial sustainable use

---

**Target 15.1** - By 2020, ensure the conservation, restoration and sustainable use of terrestrial and inland freshwater ecosystems and their services, in particular forests, wetlands, mountains and drylands...

**Target 15.5** - Take urgent and significant action to reduce the degradation of natural habitats, halt the loss of biodiversity and, by 2020, protect and prevent the extinction of threatened species

# Relevant SDG 17 Targets - means of implementation

---

**Target 17.11** - Significantly increase the exports of developing countries, in particular with a view to doubling the least developed countries' share of global exports by 2020

**Target 17.15** - Respect each country's policy space and leadership to establish and implement policies for poverty eradication and sustainable development

# The 2030 Agenda bottom line

---

**The new Agenda** - We recognise that social and economic development depends on the sustainable management of our planet's natural resources. We are therefore determined to conserve and sustainably use oceans and seas, freshwater resources, as well as forests, mountains and drylands and to protect biodiversity, ecosystems and wildlife.

- *Can the hunting industry in Africa contribute to implementing the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development*
- *Do the Sustainable Development Goals offer us with a framework for assessing this contribution?*